



The Road to the Salvation of Mankind: Additions to the Series of Glass Designs by the Crabeth Brothers

• ZSUZSANNA VAN RUYVEN-ZEMAN* •

In 1986 the Rijksmuseum staged a major exhibition, *Art before the Iconoclasm: Northern Netherlandish Art 1525-1580*, systematically charting all forms of artistic expression from that period.¹ The exhibits included glass painting in the form of stained-glass roundels, monumental church windows and designs. Dirck Crabeth (c. 1510/20-1574), the most important and probably the most productive glass painter in the Northern Netherlands, was well represented, with stained-glass windows and drawings from the fifteen-forties until the end of his career.² The drawing and the corresponding roundel *Christ as the Saviour of Man Reborn*, both in the Rijksmuseum's collection, were shown together for the first time; the catalogue entries also examined three iconographically similar drawings elsewhere and another panel in the Rijksmuseum, *The Creation of Eve, the Fall of Man, Mankind Bound by Disobedience*.³ Karel Boon, a former director of the Print Room, had previously found a link between these and other drawings with the same theme and style in the collections of the Rijksmuseum, the Fondation Custodia and the École nationale supérieure des Beaux-Arts, both in Paris, and the Museum Catharijneconvent in Utrecht.⁴ The definitive reading of the series is thanks to

< Detail of fig. 11

Daniel Horst, a researcher at the Rijksmuseum. In his discussion of a previously unknown set of twelve prints with Reformation iconography purchased by the Rijksmuseum in 1989, he also used the drawings and stained-glass panels as comparison material.⁵ The print series, dating from around 1560, bears the monogram of the Antwerp engraver Frans Huys (d. before 10 April 1562), but the design has since been attributed to the Antwerp artist Gerard van Groeningen (active 1561-c. 1575/76).⁶ With the aid of the prints, Horst was able to place the drawings and panels in the right context and analyse them in this still convincing sequence. Identifying the figures in the prints and the explanatory inscriptions were an essential part of this. Both series are concerned with the question of how mankind can attain salvation.

There are two reasons for revisiting Crabeth's group of glass designs and panels. To start with, I want to present two drawings by Dirck Crabeth that were recently spotted in the art market, one of which is the sketch for the second glass panel in the Rijksmuseum referred to above, and the other the example for one of the three drawings in Utrecht.⁷ Ilja Veldman's recent new attribution and interpretation of these three sheets in the Catharijneconvent collection is the second reason for this article.



Fig. 1
DIRCK CRABETH,
*The Creation of Eve,
the Fall of Man,
Man Bound by
Disobedience*,
c. 1545-50.

Pen and brown ink,
238 x 187 mm.
Netherlands,
private collection.



Fig. 2
DIRCK CRABETH,
*The Creation of Eve,
the Fall of Man,
Man Bound by
Disobedience*,
c. 1545-50.

Grisaille and silver
yellow on clear glass,
25 x 20 cm.
Amsterdam,
Rijksmuseum,
inv. no. BK-1984-46.

These sheets were previously part of the group discussed by Horst as coming from the workshop of Dirck Crabeth, and are now in my opinion erroneously attributed to the Antwerp artist Pieter Huys (c. 1520-before April 1586), a brother of the engraver Frans Huys, and detached from the series.⁸ After a brief recap of the iconography and tradition of Crabeth's Road to Salvation series, which will also look at two glass panels mentioned in passing at the time but not illustrated, I will narrow down the date and establish the print series' relationship to Crabeth's designs. In conclusion, I will propose a new attribution to Dirck's younger brother Wouter Crabeth for the three copies in Utrecht on the basis of stylistic comparison and another parallel in their work.

The Eight Steps on the Road to the Salvation of Mankind

The newly discovered drawings by Dirck Crabeth in the art trade are the first two episodes in the series. The first sheet, *The Creation of Eve, the Fall of Man, Man Bound by Disobedience*, begins with the Old Testament and combines two episodes from Genesis (2:21-22; 3:1-7) (fig. 1). In the foreground we see the creation of Eve from the sleeping Adam's rib, and in the background on the left the Fall of Man. The Expulsion from Paradise that usually followed this is replaced here by an allegorical representation in the background on the right: Adam is tied to a tree by the personification of Disobedience. In translation the Latin text on the banderol above the figures reads: 'Now the works of the flesh are manifest.'⁹ It is a partial quote from Galatians 5:19, which is followed by a long list of sins and the warning 'that they which do such things shall not inherit the kingdom of God' (Galatians 5:21). The glass panel in the Rijksmuseum's collection executed to this design was changed in several respects (fig. 2).¹⁰

The panel, without an inscription, proves to be an expurgated version of the original drawing, perhaps at the client's request. The genitalia of the still innocent Adam are exposed in the sketch but concealed by a blade of grass and a twig with leaves in the panel. Even more interesting is the presentation of Adam as Man in a skirt made of fig leaves. This implies Man's newfound realization that he was naked after he had eaten of the forbidden fruit and that he had to cover himself out of shame.

The second drawing is *Moses Points the Sinful Man to Hell* (fig. 3). Man from the previous episode, wearing a wreath of fig leaves around his loins, is tormented in the background by a female figure with a snake's head and a demon with a club. In translation,

Fig. 3
DIRCK CRABETH,
*Moses Points
Sinful Man to Hell*,
c. 1545-50.
Pen and brown ink,
246 x 177 mm.
Netherlands,
private collection.



Fig. 4
 Workshop of
 DIRCK CRABETH/
 WOUTER CRABETH,
*Moses Points
 Sinful Man to Hell*,
 c. 1550-60.
 Pen and dark grey ink
 over black chalk,
 washed in some
 places in light
 brown and grey ink,
 319 x 213 mm.
 Utrecht, Museum
 Catharijneconvent,
 inv. no. ABM te27.
 Photo: Ruben de Heer



the crossed-out Latin text reads ‘the horrible transgressor of every law’, freely after St Paul.¹¹ The figure with horns, Moses, points sinful Man to the fires of hell that await him on the right, while God’s wrath manifests itself in the form of a sword from his mouth. Until now this episode in the Dirck Crabeth series was known only from a drawn copy in the Museum Catharijneconvent in Utrecht (fig. 4). Ilja Veldman recently named the scene *John the Baptist Points Man Tormented by his Conscience to God’s Word* and gave it

a different interpretation.¹² She argues that the pointing figure is not Moses but John the Baptist, and that he is not pointing to the fires of hell before him, but to God in heaven. The sword moreover would rather symbolize the word of God, the Bible. She explains the obvious inconsistency with the quatrain on the back of the copy, which mentions both the law and God’s wrath, as a misunderstanding by the sixteenth-century author, and relates the text to the scene in the background.¹³ Her reasoning rests on the fact that in all



Fig. 5

DIRCK CRABETH,
*Man as a Pilgrim
 between Ingenuity
 and Good Works*,
 c. 1545-50.
 Pen and brown ink
 over black chalk,
 236 x 191 mm.
 Paris, École nationale
 supérieure des
 Beaux-Arts, inv. no.
 M699. Photo ©
 Beaux-Arts de Paris,
 Dist. RMN-Grand
 Palais / image Beaux-
 arts de Paris

Protestant propaganda images, John the Baptist is the one who introduces the new (and proper) faith to reborn Man, and that Moses is the representative of the old law (which does not work). This assertion is absolutely correct. John the Baptist will indeed get the chance to show Man the right path, but not until the penultimate, seventh episode, where he has pushed Moses into the background (fig. 11). In the second episode Man is still the old Adam, with a garland of leaves around his loins, and he still has to pass through different stages in search of his salvation. The pointing figure is not wearing a garment of camel's hair like John the Baptist, and in terms of type, clothing, the text of the quatrain and the parallels with the print series he must represent Moses. Nevertheless, the book instead of the tablets of the law, and the sword

hanging on his left hip are unusual.¹⁴ Crabeth may have made a mistake with the attributes, as he did with the Latin text. The quatrain identifies the two goblins as Conscience and Despair. Veldman thinks that the demonic figure on the right is not Despair but Sin, on the basis of a 1545 woodcut by Lieven de Witte.¹⁵

After the previous warnings, Man has begun to improve his life. In the third episode, *Man as a Pilgrim between Ingenuity and Good Works*, Crabeth's original drawing for which is in Paris, École nationale supérieure des Beaux-Arts, he has put on pilgrim clothes as a sign that he has become a follower of the Roman practices (fig. 5).¹⁶ Blindfolded Ingenuity – to be understood as the inadequate human power of reason – points him in the direction of a seated monk and the promise of



Fig. 6

DIRCK CRABETH,
*Man as a Pilgrim
between Ingenuity
and Good Works*,
c. 1545-50.
Grisaille, silver
yellow and sanguine
on clear glass,
32 x 19.5 cm.
Shrewsbury,
Shropshire,
Church of St Mary,
east window of
the north porch.

Fig. 7

DIRCK CRABETH,
*Man between
Ingenuity and Christ*,
c. 1545-50. Pen and
brown ink over black
chalk, 236 x 191 mm.
Paris, École nationale
supérieure des
Beaux-Arts, inv. no.
M698. Photo ©
Beaux-Arts de Paris,
Dist. RMN-Grand
Palais / image Beaux-
arts de Paris

three crowns, on condition that he starts to perform good works. However, this is window dressing, as expressed in the quatrain on the back of the sheet.¹⁷ Man's eyes are shut, the Bible under his arm is closed, and Ingenuity's tilted candle is extinguished as a sign that the human intellect is weak. There is a surviving glass panel to this design, which is now in St Mary's Church in Shrewsbury, England (fig. 6).¹⁸ The burning hellfire in the quatrain is clearly visible on the left. The design, originally intended for a rectangular panel, is now elongated to adapt it to the then popular shape of glass panels with an arched top.

Man between Ingenuity and Christ is the fourth episode in the series with an original drawing in the same Parisian collection, this time without an inscription on the back (fig. 7).¹⁹ Man is still shown in the guise of a pilgrim but his





Fig. 8
Workshop of
DIRCK CRABETH/
WOUTER CRABETH,
*Tormented Man
Begs God for Mercy*,
c. 1550-60.
Pen and dark grey and
brown ink over black
chalk, light brown wash
in places, 323 x 215 mm.
Utrecht, Museum
Catharijneconvent,
inv. no. ABM te28.
Photo: Ruben de Heer



Fig. 9
DIRCK CRABETH,
*Man Tormented
by Conscience and
Despair*, from the
panel *Tormented
Man Begs God for
Mercy*, c. 1545-50.
Grisaille, silver yellow
and sanguine on clear
glass, 20 x 25 cm.
The Hague, C.J.
Berserik Collection.

eyes are now open; he holds an open Bible in his hand and his head is turned to listen to Christ. Ingenuity tries to prevent this with all her might, using a pair of bellows to pump false information about the value of good works into his ear. A bedridden invalid is shown in the background probably as an illustration of good works.

The fifth episode has only survived as a copy in Utrecht, *Tormented Man Begs God for Mercy* (fig. 8).²⁰ Our pilgrim sits on a rock and in spite of his good works is still menaced by the same goblins he had to face as the old Adam in the second scene (figs. 3, 4). Conscience, with a scourge in its right hand, grabs Man by the hair and gnaws at his heart, while Ingenuity pushes a burning torch under his nose. They force Man to repent in the scene in the background. Man begs God for forgiveness and mercy, and God hears him. Instead of a quatrain on the verso the major figures are shown speaking Latin. Man, seated, complains: 'Mine

iniquities have taken hold of me.'²¹ From the mouth of the kneeling man in the background comes the plea 'Have mercy on me, a sinner', to which God replies 'Come unto me, all ye that labour and are heavy laden.'²² Because Dirck's original design has not survived we do not know whether the *penitimento* by God's right arm was an improvement by the copyist, or whether he had originally experimented with a different pose for God the Father and then changed it. A badly mutilated glass panel in The Hague comes closer to Dirck Crabeth's style than the drawn copy in Utrecht (fig. 9). Although Veldman identifies the panel as *Man between God's Word and Sin* it is clearly an incorrectly restored version of Dirck Crabeth's design.²³ The scene in the foreground with Man and Despair is all that has survived. The unknown restorer turned the figure of Conscience, still recognizable from her trunk, into an angel and extended her scourge as a sword.

We also know the sixth episode as a copy in Utrecht after Dirck Crabeth's design, *Reborn Man Is Equipped with Christian Armour by God* (fig. 10).²⁴ Man has taken off his pilgrim's clothes; his hat, staff and canteen also lie next to him on the ground. The plea from his mouth reads: 'Create in me a clean heart, O God.' to which God replies: 'Put on therefore, as the elect of God.'²⁵ The drawing is the only one of the three copies to have a quatrain on the

verso as well as the Latin inscriptions on the recto.²⁶ Man is reborn and receives from God 'the shield of faith, the helmet of salvation and the sword of the spirit', attributes of the Christian warrior.²⁷ Immediately Despair, Blind Ingenuity and Death flee from him, like the graceful woman in the centre. According to the quatrain she is 'innate ability', Man's (earlier) conviction to perform good works in order to obtain salvation of his soul.



Fig. 10
Workshop of
DIRCK CRABETH/
WOUTER CRABETH,
*Reborn Man is
Handed the Christian
Armour by God*,
c. 1550-60.
Pen and dark brown
ink over black chalk;
some outlines
touched up in dark
grey ink, brown
and grey wash,
325 x 216 mm.
Utrecht, Museum
Catharijneconvent,
inv. no. ABM te29.
Photo:
Ruben de Heer

The penultimate, seventh episode, which we know from a sketch in the Rijksmuseum, shows *Christ as the Saviour of Man Reborn* (fig. 11).²⁸ The naked, 'nieu creatuer' is now embraced by Belief and directed to Christ by John the Baptist. This is emphasized by John's words: 'Behold! The Lamb of God, who takes away the sins of the

world.'²⁹ On the cross are the words of Christ: 'And I, if I am lifted up from the earth, will draw all peoples to Myself,' whereupon Man replies: 'take me.'³⁰ Christ ascends the cross with the Devil, Death, a naked man and two women who cannot be further identified on his back. They may represent personifications of various sins.

Fig. 11
DIRCK CRABETH,
*Christ as the
Saviour of Man
Reborn*, c. 1545-50.
Pen and brown ink
over black chalk,
322 x 190 mm.
Amsterdam,
Rijksmuseum,
inv. no. RP-T-1960-175.



The quatrain on the verso emphasizes that Christ is the only gateway to the Father.³¹ This is why a prophet and Moses with his staff have been pushed into the background, behind John the Baptist. The corresponding glass panel, without the Latin inscriptions, has survived incomplete (fig. 12).³² As so often happens, the semi-circular top,

provided for in the design, has been lost, and the topmost part of the Cross above the horizontal beam is missing.

The last episode, the drawing in Paris, Fondation Custodia (F. Lugt Collection), Institut Néerlandais, *The Fight of New Man against the Forces of Evil*, brings together the beginning and the end: the old Adam and the new

Fig. 12
DIRCK CRABETH,
*Christ as the Saviour
of Man Reborn*,
c. 1545-50.
Grisaille and silver
yellow on clear glass,
25 x 20.5 cm.
Amsterdam,
Rijksmuseum,
inv. no. BK-1984-45.





Fig. 13
DIRCK CRABETH,
*The Fight of New Man
against the Forces
of Evil*, c. 1545-50.
Pen and brown ink
over black chalk,
335 x 194 mm.
Paris, Fondation
Custodia (F. Lugt
Collection), Institut
Néerlandais,
inv. no. 3950.

Man (fig. 13).³³ In the meantime the latter has been dressed as a Christian warrior and crosses swords with the Devil, all kinds of monsters and a false prophet on the right. The old Adam tries to intervene but he is held back by Faith. Immediately above the action are the words 'Good is set against evil, and so also is the sinner against a just man.'³⁴ Christ the Saviour with the cross on his shoulder, God the Father and the Holy Ghost look down from heaven, while Death hands a crown to the

Christian warrior. In the clouds are the words 'the glorious death of the saints'.³⁵ The quatrain on the back literally puts the scene into words.³⁶

The Christian warrior also figures in yet another drawing by Dirck Crabeth in the Rijksmuseum, *Man as a Christian Warrior between God's Wrath and the Devil*. This scene, which Horst had already regarded as problematically fitting into the series, does indeed not belong in our group. It forms a pair with an as yet unpublished drawing by Dirck Crabeth in New York. On the sword in both drawings there is the inscription 'TLEVENDE / WOERT' (The Living Word) instead of the Latin inscriptions in our series, and stylistically they appear to have been created later.³⁷

Dating of Dirck Crabeth's Original Designs and the Relationship to Huys's Print Series

Dirck Crabeth has a large oeuvre of drawings, which are entirely devoted to his glass painting. As well as fourteen designs for church windows and an impressive series of cartoons for six of his Gouda windows, we also know of thirty or so pen-and-ink drawings for glass panels, not all of which, however, are by his hand.³⁸ The execution differs according to the function of the drawing. As before, the designs for glass panels are usually line drawings, those for church windows are washed pen-and-ink drawings, and the cartoons were executed in chalk. He signed neither his drawings nor his stained glass, but his characteristic style is now well known. The four drawings of the Road to Salvation, one in Amsterdam and three in Paris referred to above, were long ago recognized as by his hand, and the three in Utrecht as workshop pieces produced to his designs. In literature the four are usually dated in the fifteen-sixties and only on one occasion to the first half of the fifteen-fifties.³⁹ Similarities to designs for the only surviving dated series of glass



panels by Dirck Crabeth from the house at 9 Pieterskerkgracht in Leiden may argue in favour of early work. Since the first publication of this combined series, dating from 1543 and now in the Musée des Arts Décoratifs in Paris, we know of seven designs in total, six for the Samuel cycle and one for the Paul cycle placed below it.⁴⁰ In the drawing *Samuel Anoints Saul King*, Saul looks strikingly like the pilgrim in the two drawings in Paris (figs. 5, 7, 14), while Samuel is similar to Moses in type and physique, with the stocky legs implied under their clothes and the swords at their sides (figs. 3, 14). Another parallel with the Samuel cycle is found in the figures of Adam and the man who empties a pitcher on the left in the drawing *Samuel Sacrifices a Ram to Jahweh* in Amsterdam. There are even more likenesses between various men's heads, like Samuel and Moses, or the second man on the left with the long beard and God the Father (figs. 3, 15). Finally, in addition to the Leiden series of 1543, a design for a church window, *Christ and the Tribute Money with Emperor Charles v*, likewise in Amsterdam (fig. 16), can be seen as an argument for the early dating of the Road to Salvation cycle.⁴¹ Despite the difference in function, scale and drawing technique, the similarity between the Christ figure in this design and this figure in one of the sheets in Paris (fig. 7) is unmistakable.



Fig. 14
DIRCK CRABETH,
*Samuel Anoints
Saul King*, 1543.
Pen and brownish
black ink over black
chalk, 250 x 193 mm.
Paris, Haboldt & Co.

Fig. 15
DIRCK CRABETH,
*Samuel Sacrifices a
Ram to Jahweh*, 1543.
Pen in brownish black
ink over black chalk,
257 x 200 mm.
Amsterdam,
Rijksmuseum,
inv. no. RP-T-1992-85.

Fig. 16

DIRCK CRABETH,
*Christ and the Tribute
 Money with Emperor
 Charles V*, 1543-49.
 Pen and black ink,
 grey and red wash,
 371 x 178 mm.
 Amsterdam,
 Rijksmuseum,
 inv. no. RP-T-1937-13.



In Dirck's later works, starting with his first Gouda window in 1555, the compact figure style gives way to more elongated figures, which justifies the early dating of the Road to Salvation cycle to the period 1545-50. Another characteristic also points to this dating. Dirck Crabeth often used Latin inscriptions in his monumental stained glass. In the designs/corresponding panels of the story of St Paul and the Road to Salvation, however, we find the only examples of integrated texts in panels,

albeit that in the Road to Salvation series there is a text on only one surviving panel (fig. 6).⁴²

Given the difference in dating between Crabeth's glass designs and Frans Huys's prints – the designs from the second half of the fifteen-forties and the prints from around 1560 – there can be no question of the prints having any influence on the drawings.⁴³ As yet we cannot identify a common source; but in view of the unusually large iconographic similarities to the

print series, the German multi-scene woodcut by the Monogrammist N.G., *The Origin of Sin and the Judgment of Man before God*, may well have served as the example for it.⁴⁴ The reverse influence of Crabeth's designs on Gerard van Groeningen's is also doubtful. The greatest similarity is in the episode Man between Ingenuity and Christ (figs. 7, 17). For the rest, similar ideas are always depicted differently, spread over more scenes with additions and with figures in different clothes, and the story has a different conclusion: new Man dies without having gone through the stage of being a militant warrior of Christ.⁴⁵ Crabeth's glass panels and Huys's prints are expressions of Reformation ideas common in the sixteenth century, and were intended for a Lutheran clientele, as Horst had already argued.⁴⁶

The Maker of the Three Copies in Museum Catharijneconvent in Utrecht

With the discovery of Dirck Crabeth's original design from which one of the

drawings in Utrecht was copied, the old attribution to one of the artist's assistants can be reinstated.⁴⁷ Like the originals, the copies are pen-and-ink drawings over black chalk, now with some wash for the shadow passages. Compared to the original, their style is far more Mannerist, which is particularly obvious in the two versions of *Moses Points Sinful Man to Hell* (figs. 3, 4). The squat proportions of the two figures in the foreground of Dirck's design are lengthened and Moses's slim legs show through his long, thin tunic much more clearly. The copyist remained true to the original down to the tiniest details, like the hands and the feet, but with subtle alterations. For example, the left hand of the old Adam in Dirck Crabeth's drawing, which corresponds exactly to Saul's left hand (figs. 1, 14), was given somewhat longer, slim fingers in the Utrecht copy. Aside from the materials used and the figure style, the drawing technique is also different. Crabeth's characteristic short, arch-like dashes he used to articulate the faces and



Fig. 17
 FRANS HUYS
 after GERARD
 VAN GROENINGEN,
*Annunciation/
 Man between
 Ingenuity and Christ*,
 from the series *The
 Road to the Salvation
 of Man*, c. 1560.
 Engraving,
 275 x 362 mm.
 Amsterdam,
 Rijksmuseum,
 inv. no. RP-P-1989-168.

Fig. 18

DIRCK CRABETH,
*St Catherine from
 the Cartoon for
 Window 6*, 1571.
 Black chalk, approx.
 3,200 x 680 mm.
 Gouda, Church of
 St John, strip B1,
 detail.

bodies are replaced by short parallel lines, and hatching was even added in the robe of God the Father. This copyist's hand cannot be detected in any of Dirck Crabeth's workshop drawings. It points to someone who was close to Dirck Crabeth but at the same time had developed a more advanced, individual style, which is why it is tempting to see the hand of the young Wouter Crabeth (c. 1520/30 - September 1589).

We do not know the exact date of birth of this younger brother, nor Dirck's. It is generally accepted that there was a difference of ten to twenty years between them.⁴⁸ Wouter, like Dirck, would have learnt his trade in their father's workshop and he later

worked with his brother for a time. In 1560 and 1562 he carried out portrait commissions for Dirck for his windows whether they were executed or not. He did not make his debut until 1561 in the Church of St John with a stained-glass window of the abbess of Rijnsburg, the first of his four windows in Gouda. Far fewer works by him are known outside Gouda, all taking their attributions from his documented work in Gouda, and with one exception all undated. They are three designs for church windows (one dated 1567), one design that may be for a tapestry, two designs for small glass panels and eleven such glass panels, the latter all sold to England. In his first window, *Solomon and the Queen of Sheba*, Wouter's style was already different from Dirck's. Whereas the older artist was clearly classically inspired, the younger artist's work has a more Mannerist touch, based on artists such as Frans Floris (1515/20-1570). We do not know where Wouter mastered this style, perhaps on supposed trips to France and Italy or from prints he had seen. The three copies in Utrecht after Dirck's work could be an interim stage in Wouter's development from the late fifteenties, and can be regarded as Wouter's earliest drawings. It is interesting how Conscience's small-breasted body in Dirck's drawing was changed into a sensual being in the copy. This is reflected in the female saints in the brothers' later cartoons for windows, despite the difference in size and technique compared to the designs: Dirck's monumental, robust *St Catherine* in a diaphanous robe, and the more elegant, supple figure of Wouter's *St Margaret*, whose voluptuous lines are accentuated by 'wet drapery' (figs. 18, 19). As we have seen, Wouter's small drawn oeuvre known up till now contained only two sketches for glass panels (fig. 20).⁴⁹ Despite their identical function and the fact that they are almost the same size as the Utrecht sheets, these later drawings of Bible

Fig. 19

WOUTER CRABETH,
*St Margaret from
 the Cartoon for
 Window 23*, 1562.
 Black chalk, brush and
 brown ink, approx.
 3,400 x 700 mm.
 Gouda, Church of
 St John, strip E1,
 detail.





Fig. 20
WOUTER CRABETH,
*The Pharisee and the
Innkeeper*, c. 1565-70.
Black chalk, pen and

brush and brown ink,
312 x 215 mm.
Brussels, private
collection.

Fig. 21
DIRCK CRABETH
or workshop,
*Moses before the
Pharaoh*, c. 1555-60.
Grisaille, silver yellow
and sanguine on clear
glass, 30.5 x 25.5 cm.
Cornwall, St Michael's
Mount, Chevy Chase
Room.



Fig. 22
WOUTER CRABETH,
*Moses before the
Pharaoh*, c. 1560.
Grisaille and silver
yellow on clear glass,
25 x 20 cm.
Cholmondeley,
Cheshire, Cholmondeley
Castle Chapel.

scenes do not lend themselves well to comparison. This is due not only to the meticulous finishing touches in pen and brush, but also to the refined composition with Renaissance architecture, partly influenced by the three Gouda windows to a design by Lambert van Noort (c. 1520-1570/71). It is only the swift drawing of the background, the mountain landscape and the tree with short strokes in pen in *The Pharisee and the Innkeeper* that show some similarity to one of the sheets in Utrecht (figs. 20, 8). Wouter Crabeth would go on to use the typical kneeling pose of reborn Man (fig. 10) again, not only for the Pharisee, but for the high priest in his stained-glass window with Heliodorus (1566) in the Church of St John in Gouda.

The collaboration between the brothers may have lasted until around 1564. We still have an example from that period showing how Wouter appeared to have followed in Dirck's footsteps. It is the repetition of Dirck's scene *Moses before the Pharaoh* (Exodus 7:10-12) in St Michael's Mount, in Wouter's panel in Cholmondeley (figs. 21, 22).⁵⁰ The different styles of the two artists are easily recognizable despite the severe damage to both



panels. This parallel once again illustrates the old practice of repeated use of successful designs, either in an identical style, as in the case of the Samuel cycle in Leiden, replicas of which were made later, or in an individual idiom of the copyist, as in the Road to Salvation series.⁵¹ In 1564 both Dirck and Wouter bought houses in different locations in Gouda, where they must have continued their workshops separately.⁵² From 1563 Wouter Crabeth went his own way, not only in the drawing technique of his designs for glass panels but also in his cartoons by adding washes. Unlike Dirck, he never used Latin inscriptions in his drawings or windows. In the two copies in Utrecht he undoubtedly did so in imitation of the still unknown original by Dirck. One of the sheets has no inscription because the text in the original was crossed out (figs. 3, 4).

In Conclusion

The quatrains on the verso of five drawings out of the group of eight, sometimes in combination with Latin bible quotes on the recto, present us with a mystery. If they were intended as a text panel under the picture, we would expect to see them on all the sheets, particularly on those with the same provenance like the sheets in Utrecht or those in the *École nationale supérieure des Beaux-Arts* in Paris. Similar quatrains on the back can be found on at least three more sheets from other series from the Crabeth workshop.⁵³ A study of the characteristics of the sixteenth-century handwriting on all the sheets suggests that they are all by the same hand, but were not written at the same time or with the same pen. They were not penned by the Crabeths, whose handwriting we know from the Gouda documents. Perhaps someone added appropriate passages to a number of drawings from Dirck's workshop stock shortly after his death with the intention of making an inventory or repeat.

In view of the Protestant nature of the Road to Salvation series the glass panels must have been intended for a private house and made for the first time around 1550. Nothing whatsoever is known about the original provenance of any fifteenth- or sixteenth-century Netherlandish roundels, with the exception of the Samuel and Paul cycles in Leiden. Historical interiors of homes were susceptible to fashion, change of function or even demolition. With the arrival of sash windows in the eighteenth century, cross windows fell out of fashion and their roundels were removed and sold. Most of them were shipped to England and installed in churches and country houses. Three of the four recovered panels in the Road to Salvation series evidently spent some time together in Oxford, judging by the earliest documented provenance of the two glass panels in the Rijksmuseum from the Lady Chapel of Christ Church Cathedral, and that of the panel in the Berserik Collection in the Bodleian Library. The eight episodes discussed in this article would have fitted into two cross windows, that is if there were no more episodes in the series. The designs of the seventh and eighth episodes suggest a glass panel with a semi-circular top. The panel in Shrewsbury, corresponding to the third episode, is the only one in this original shape. The drawings and the glass panels have clearly not stood the test of time unscathed. They have been cut and sometimes downright mutilated. Nevertheless, they still give us a fascinating glimpse into the thinking in Lutheran circles with spiritualist influences. The idea that Man is judged by his belief in Christ and not by Good Works had literally served as a shining example for the client who commissioned the series.

ABSTRACT

The two newly-discovered drawings by the glass painter Dirck Crabeth presented here fit seamlessly into his series *The Road to the Salvation of Man*, which has long been known. The drawings are the design for the first episode, until recently known only as a glass panel, and the original of the second episode, the copy of which, along with two copies of other episodes are in Museum Catharijneconvent in Utrecht. Stylistic clues have made it possible to date Dirck Crabeth's drawings and the corresponding surviving glass panels earlier, to around 1545-50. They share the thinking represented in a Lutheran series of prints by Frans Huys dating from around 1560 to a design by Gerard van Groeningen, which was discussed by Daniel Horst. An analysis of the career of the young Wouter Crabeth, his collaboration with Dirck and characteristics of their different styles demonstrates that the three copies in Utrecht could be by Wouter Crabeth, contrary to the recent attribution by Ilja Veldman to the Antwerp artist Pieter Huys, Frans's brother, and in line with the previously held attribution to one of Dirck's assistants.

NOTES

- * I would like to thank Dr Daniel R. Horst for his help in interpreting the iconography of the series and Dr Régis de la Haye for his assistance in analysing the handwriting and deciphering the crossed-out text in fig. 3.
- 1 Jan-Piet Filedt Kok et al. (eds.), *Art before the Iconoclasm: Northern Netherlandish Art 1525-1580*, exh. cat. Amsterdam (Rijksmuseum) 1986.
 - 2 Filedt Kok et al. 1986 (note 1), nos. 159-68, 240-46.
 - 3 Filedt Kok et al. 1986 (note 1), nos. 240-41.
 - 4 Karel G. Boon, *L'epoque de Lucas de Leyde et Pierre Bruegel. Dessin des Anciens Pays-Bas. Collection Frits Lugt*, exh. cat. Florence (Istituto Universitario Olandese di Storia dell'Arte)/Paris (Institut Neerlandais) 1980-81, no. 61. For his discussion in a different sequence from ours, and minus one drawing in Utrecht, see idem, 'De glasschilder David Joris, een exponent van het doperse geloof. Zijn kunst en zijn invloed op Dirck Crabeth', *Academia Analecta* 49 (1988), no. 1, pp. 117-37, esp. pp. 129-32.
 - 5 Daniel R. Horst, 'Een zestiende-eeuwse reformatorische prentenreeks van Frans Huys over de Heilsweg van de Mens', *Bulletin van het Rijksmuseum* 38 (1990), no. 1, pp. 3-23.
 - 6 Amsterdam, Rijksmuseum, inv. no. RP-P-1989-162/173. *The New Hollstein. Dutch & Flemish Etchings Engravings and Woodcuts 1450-1700: Gerard van Groeningen*, 2 vols., Rotterdam 1997, 1, nos. 159-70. The design of the series is attributed to Van Groeningen in the documents bequeathed by Hans Mielke and later published.
 - 7 Sale, Paris (Aguttes), 3 April 2020, no. 146, described as *The Story of Adam and Eve* and *The Last Judgement*, German, seventeenth century. With thanks to Monroe Warshaw who recognized the two drawings as works by Dirck Crabeth and drew my attention to them.
 - 8 Yvonne Bleyerveld and Ilja M. Veldman, 'Hoogtepunten uit Museum Catharijneconvent: Nederlandse tekeningen 1549-1806', *Delineavit et Sculpsit* 43 (2018), nos. 4a-4c, pp. 18-25.
 - 9 'manifesta sunt opera carnis Gal 5'.
 - 10 Pieter C. Ritsema van Eck, *Gebrandschilderde ruitjes uit de Nederlanden 1480-1560/Painted Glass Roundels from the Netherlands 1480-1560*, Zwolle 1999 (*Aspecten van de verzameling Beeldhouwkunst en Kunstnijverheid/Aspects of the Collection Sculpture and Decorative Arts*, vol. 9), no. 37.
 - 11 'execrabilis o[mn]is legis prevaricator'. The expression 'praevaricator legis' occurs twice in the Vulgate Bible in St Paul's Epistle to the Romans (2:25 and 2:27).
 - 12 Bleyerveld and Veldman 2018 (note 8), no. 4b, pp. 21-22.
 - 13 'Die wet hem door zyn sonde ontdeckte/ goedt toorne ende verdommenis voor oogen hy sach/ vertwyfeling hem tot ermen verwecte/ consciencie dreef hem tot groot geclach.'
 - 14 In an exchange of emails Veldman suggests a different identification as a non-specific allegorical figure, or perhaps St Paul, but even then the dress and appearance are not correct. She also thinks that the copyist misunderstood Dirck Crabeth's design. With thanks to Ilja Veldman for the exchange of ideas after I showed her the newly discovered drawings.
 - 15 Bleyerveld and Veldman 2018 (note 8), pp. 100-01, note 3. In the series of prints

- by Huys, Despair does figure again in the guise of a similar but dressed ugly old woman with a scourge.
- 16 *Renaissance et Maniérisme dans les Ecoles du Nord. Dessins des collections de l'Ecole des Beaux-Arts*, exh. cat. Paris (École nationale supérieure des Beaux-Arts)/Hamburg (Kunsthalle) 1985-86, p. 130, under no. 64.
 - 17 'Om te winnen de Croonen d'helsche gloet te v(lien)/ 't vernuft de mensche tot eygen verdiensten ley/ maer blind sonder waerheyt der dingen in te sien/ wiens licht oock niet en is als enckel duysterheyt'.
 - 18 William Cole, *A Catalogue of Netherlandish and North European Roundels in Britain*, Summary Catalogue 1, Oxford 1993 (*Corpus Vitrearum Medii Aevi: Great Britain*), no. 2052.
 - 19 Exh. cat. Paris/Hamburg 1985-86 (note 16), no. 64. Since Boon 1988 (note 4), p. 132, note 43, the glass panel has been wrongly associated with this drawing.
 - 20 Bleyerveld and Veldman 2018 (note 8), no. 4a, pp. 21, 24. Veldman reverses the order of this and our second scene, reasoning from her aforementioned identification of the pointing figure in fig. 4 as John the Baptist. The sequence of Man's coverings, first as the old Adam with a wreath of leaves around his loins and then as a pilgrim, indicates the correct order.
 - 21 'Co[m]prehenderunt me/ iniquitates me[a]e' (Psalm 40:12).
 - 22 'propiti[us] esto mihi peccatori' (Luke 18:13); 'Venite ad me qui laboratis et onerati estis' (Matthew 11:28).
 - 23 Bleyerveld and Veldman 2018 (note 8), p. 25 with illustration. The panel was already mentioned in Horst 1990 (note 5), note 19 with its former location in the Bodleian Library in Oxford (on the basis of the documentation in the Conway Collection, London, Courtauld Institute). Since then, it has been removed from the collection and has had a number of owners. Attribution and identification of the panel by Kees Berserik, who has owned it since 2001.
 - 24 Bleyerveld and Veldman 2018 (note 8), no. 4c, pp. 20, 22-25.
 - 25 'Cor mu[m]du[m] crea in me Deus' (Psalm 51:10); 'Sitis induti tanq[quam] electi Dei' (Colossians 3:12).
 - 26 'Door genade inden geest wert hy gedoopt/ eygen vermoogen verwerp hy dan al niet/ vernuft doot sonden ende al van hem loopt/ een nieu creatuer men hem aentrecken ziet'.
 - 27 For the armour of the Christian Knight, see Ephesians 6:10-18.
 - 28 Karel G. Boon, *Netherlandish Drawings of the Fifteenth and Sixteenth Centuries in the Rijksmuseum*, 2 vols., The Hague 1978, no. 163.
 - 29 'ecce agnus dei qui tollit pec[c]a[ta] mu[n]di' (John 1:29).
 - 30 'Exaltatus a terra traham omnia ad me ipsum' (John 12:32); 'trahe me'. This comes from prayers that are said at a deathbed. See Ritsema van Eck 1999 (note 10), no. 39.
 - 31 'Door Geloove wert hi dan gewis/ Dat hoope in Christo alleene gelt/ Die tot den Vader D'eenighe poorte is/ Soe ons clærlick schrifteur vermelt'.
 - 32 Ritsema van Eck 1999 (note 10), no. 40.
 - 33 Karel G. Boon, *The Netherlandish and German Drawings of the xvth and xvith Centuries of the Frits Lugt Collection*, 3 vols., 1992, no. 63.
 - 34 'contra malum bonum/ contra iustum peccator'. This statement can now be identified as a free translation from Ecclesiasticus (The Wisdom of Jesus the Son of Sirach) 33:15, which Protestants regard as an apocryphal text.
 - 35 'Mors Sanctorum Gloriosa'. This is a free quote from Psalm 116:15 'Pretiosa in conspectu Domini mors sanctorum ejus' ('precious in the sight of the Lord is the death of his saints'). Horst 1990 (note 5), note 25, draws a comparison with the equally fitting quote from James 1:12 ('Blessed is the man who endures temptation; for when he has been approved, he will receive the crown of life which the Lord has promised to those who love Him.').
 - 36 'Dan gevoelt hy een gestadighen stry[t]/ D'oude Adam den geest rebelleert/ Christus hem met des lichaems doot bevrijt/ Van alle druck en in syn Ryck coroneert.' Since the quotation in Boon 1980-81 (note 4) p. 80 the last word was read incorrectly as 'sommeert'.
 - 37 Boon 1978 (note 28), no. 162, inv. no. RP-T-1947-2; Horst 1990 (note 5), fig. 7, pp. 8, 16. New York, Metropolitan Museum of Art, inv. no. 2012.184.
 - 38 For the most recent overview of Dirck Crabeth's oeuvre, including his stained-glass windows, see Zsuzsanna van Ruyven-Zeman, *Stained Glass in the Netherlands before 1795*, Amsterdam 2011 (*Corpus Vitrearum The Netherlands*, vol. 4), pp. 473-75 and the index on p. 782. For his cartoons see idem et al., *De cartons van de Sint-Janskerk in Gouda/The Cartoons of the Sint-Janskerk in Gouda*, Delft 2011. See also Xander van Eck et al., *The Stained-*

- Glass Windows in the Sint Janskerk at Gouda: The Works of Dirck and Wouter Crabeth*, Amsterdam 2002 (*Corpus Vitrearum The Netherlands*, vol. 2).
- 39 Boon 1980-81 (note 4), no. 61, 1560s; Filedt Kok et al. 1986 (note 1), nos. 240-41, c. 1550-55; Timothy B. Husband et al., *The Luminous Image: Painted Roundels in the Lowlands, 1480-1560*, exh. cat. New York (The Metropolitan Museum of Art) 1995 offers various dates: the Utrecht copy incorrectly as a work by Dirck Crabeth, c. 1550-55 (p. 29, fig. 24) himself, and the drawing in the Rijksmuseum with the corresponding panel c. 1560-65 (nos. 127-28). Ritsema van Eck 1999 (note 10), nos. 39-40, 1560-70; Zsuzsanna van Ruyven-Zeman, 'The Gouda Windows Revisited: An Unexecuted Design by Wouter Crabeth', *Oud Holland* 132 (2019), pp. 209-27, esp. p. 213, fig. 5, c. 1560-65.
- 40 Filedt Kok et al. 1986 (note 1), nos. 160, 164-65. The four drawings discovered since then are in the Rijksmuseum (*Samuel and His Parents before the High Priest Eli and Samuel Sacrifices a Ram to Jahweh*, inv. no. RP-T-1992-84 and 85), in Cambridge, MA, Fogg Art Museum (*The Philistines Capture the Ark of the Covenant*, inv. 2013.41), and in the art trade (*Samuel Anoints Saul as King*, in sale, Paris (Drouot), 1 January 2020, no. 33).
- 41 Van Ruyven-Zeman 2011 (note 38), 546-47. The design was intended for the earlier windows of the Church of St John in Gouda, which were destroyed by fire in 1552.
- 42 *The Conversion of Paul* in Paris: Boon 1992 (note 33), no. 62, and fig. 49 of the corresponding panel with inscription in Addington.
- 43 See esp. Horst 1990 (note 5), p. 1.
- 44 For this woodcut in the Derschau Collection, Berlin, Staatliche Kupferstichkabinett, see Robert W. Scribner, *For the Sake of Simple Folk: Popular Propaganda for the German Reformation*, Cambridge/New York 1981, pp. 208-11, fig. 196. Veldman links the woodcut in Husband et al. 1995 (note 39), p. 29 to Huys's print series for the first time.
- 45 The ideas behind the eight episodes of the panel series consequently correspond to some scenes from the print series, as illustrated in Horst 1990. Episode 1: pp. 4-5, figs. 1-2 (1st-3rd scenes); 2: pp. 5-7, figs. 3-5 (4th-8th scenes); 3: pp. 8-9, figs. 8-9 (9th to 11th scenes); 4: p. 10, fig. 11 (14th scene); 5: p. 12, fig. 14 (17th and 18th scenes); 6: p. 13, fig. 15 (19th scene); 7: p. 14, fig. 18 (21st and 22nd scenes); 8: p. 15, fig. 19 (23rd scene).
- 46 Horst 1990 (note 5), pp. 17-21.
- 47 The attribution to Pieter Huys in Bleyerveld and Veldman 2018 (note 8), nos. 4a-c with the dating 1561-62 was based on the Protestant iconography of his other designs and of the work of his brother, Frans Huys, and the supposed stylistic affinity to the draughtsman of the Momus emblem (ibid. no. 3), which Veldman also attributed to Pieter Huys. She therefore regards the three drawings as an independent, incomplete series.
- 48 For the most recent overview of Wouter Crabeth's oeuvre see Van Ruyven-Zeman 2011 (note 38), pp. 475-76 and the index on p. 782; supplemented in idem 2019 (note 39), pp. 209-27. See also Van Eck et al. 2002 (note 38).
- 49 Zsuzsanna van Ruyven-Zeman, 'De gebroeders Crabeth en Willem Tybaut, nieuw werk van de kunstenaars van de Goudse glazen', *Delineavit et Sculptis* 31 (2007), pp. 8-11; Idem, 'Wouter Crabeth from Gouda: His Glass Panels in Britain and a Newly Discovered Design', *The Burlington Magazine* 153 (2011), pp. 458-63.
- 50 Cole 1993 (note 18), St Michael's Mount, no. 1937, c. 1550 with two attributions: by Cole to the Master of the Prodigal Son and by the author to Dirck Crabeth; Cholmondeley, no. 487, c. 1550, with two attributions: by Cole to the Master of the Prodigal Son, and by the author to Wouter Crabeth.
- 51 Old replicas of two panes from the Samuel series are now in a Dutch private collection. Filedt Kok et al. 1986 (note 1), nos. 162-63.
- 52 A.A.J. Rijkssen, *Gespiegeld in kerkeglas*, Lochem [1947], pp. 84-85. Until that time Dirck was living in his father's house; where Wouter was living is unknown. In 1553 Wouter and his two sisters sold their share of his father's house to Dirck.
- 53 Ilja M. Veldman, 'Job, Tobit en goede werken: ontwerpen uit het atelier van Dirck Crabeth voor glasruitjes in gasthuizen', *Delineavit et Sculptis* 39 (2015), pp. 2-22, esp. pp. 6-7 and fig. 4; Boon 1992 (note 33), fig. 52. For illustrations of quatrains from the Road to Salvation series, see ibid. figs. 50-51 (École nationale supérieure des Beaux-Arts, Rijksmuseum), fig. 21 (Fondation Custodia), Bleyerveld and Veldman 2018 (note 8), pp. 19-20.